

# MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY

The African e-Journals Project has digitized full text of articles of eleven social science and humanities journals. This item is from the digital archive maintained by Michigan State University Library. Find more at:

<http://digital.lib.msu.edu/projects/africanjournals/>

Available through a partnership with



*Scroll down to read the article.*

### BOOK REVIEWS

**'Rhodesians Never Die': The Impact of War and Political Change on White Rhodesia, c.1970-1980** By Peter Godwin and Ian Hancock. Harare, Baobab Books, 1994, xvi, 400 pp., ISBN 0-908311-82-6, Z\$100.

In 1971 the Rhodesian Ministry of Information issued a booklet called *Rhodesia in Brief*. Its purpose was to attract White immigrants to replace those Whites who had emigrated during the slump which followed the break-up of the Federation. Among its more memorable claims was that in coming to Rhodesia the new arrivals would find themselves removed from 'a troubled world, greatly beset by the vexatious problems of the twentieth century' (p. 28). A Rhodesia Front ministry clearly did not consider that imperialism and its dismantling were high among our century's problems. By 1970 the Front felt sufficiently confident that its 1965 gamble had paid off and had declared Rhodesia a republic. During the Liberation War and the various constitutional conferences which punctuated it, Smith never seemed to understand that Rhodesia was a British colony and that the days had gone when people in Europe regarded Whites ruling Blacks in Africa as part of the eternal fitness of things. Smith never registered the huge ideological shift which had taken place in Britain even though the Rhodesia Front's rebellion could be righted and the war ended only if, for the first time in its history, Britain assumed direct control of the colony's government. The sovereignty of Rhodesia was Britain's and only Britain could hand over power to the nationalists. UDI was an affront against history and was the direct cause of the death of perhaps 50 000 people. And yet Smith recalled that awful time between 1965 and Zimbabwe's independence as 'fourteen great years' which he had accorded Rhodesians.

Peter Godwin and Ian Hancock address the events of the last ten of those years in *'Rhodesians Never Die'*. They are peculiarly well placed to provide different perspectives on those years from the authors of other published works which deal with the same period.

Godwin is a White Zimbabwean and, unlike most of the people who have written about Rhodesia, he knows the White community from inside. He was, however, a sceptical Rhodesian. Rhodesians were not peculiarly heroic or peculiarly evil. They were a fairly unremarkable group of people of some diversity. With the help of imported capital and Black labour, they had created a relatively developed economy. The privileges which this gave them was perhaps the only bond which united them. Like any privileged group, they wanted to retain their position and from the earliest settler elections they voted for whoever seemed able to guarantee it. They were even willing to fight although as the book shows, as soon as the call-

ups interrupted the easy flow of settler life, people started drifting away. When it was obvious that their privileges would be lost, the majority of Whites simply fled the country.

Hancock is an outsider, an Australian academic. His *White Liberals, Moderates and Radicals in Rhodesia 1953-1980* (Beckenham, Croom Helm, 1984) is the only full study of White Rhodesia's opposition parties and groups. More than any one, he knows that over the last 30 years of Rhodesia's life there were always Rhodesians, both to the left and the right of the dominant power group, who were aware of other political possibilities than those which were followed. Having studied the liberals as a group, Hancock knows that the only White in public life who almost always understood what was happening was Allan Savory. Twenty years later it is easy to forget the fury which greeted Savory's use in Parliament of 'guerrilla' instead of the politically correct 'terrorist' and the incomprehension of RF MPs when he claimed that the side which won Black support would win the war. Savory's arrogance gave him the confidence to vie with Lamont as the White other Whites most liked to hate. It also made it difficult for him to work with anyone. The liberals knew that Whites wanted to hear only what was comforting; Savory wanted to tell them what was going to happen. As long as the liberals sought power from the electorate, Savory was a liability.

In comparison with the parties to the right of the RF, however, the liberals had the pulse of national life at their finger tips. Through the pages of this book stalk grotesque characters like Len Idensohn and Wilfred Brooks. Both believed that Smith was in the pay of what Brook's weekly would have called international communism. For all its blindness, the right recognised much more quickly than most Whites that Smith's agreement to the Kissinger proposals in 1976 was — what this book calls it — a surrender. In agreeing to hand over power to the Black majority within two years, Smith had turned his back on every political principle he had ever stood for. Of course, he refused to admit that this was what had happened and probably believed that he was negotiating a situation thrust on him by South Africa's betrayal. He never seems to have admitted that he was responding to an agenda which Blacks had made.

Godwin and Hancock describe their narrative as one written 'on the principle of listening and observing' and the text is largely constructed around the interviews both authors carried out with a large number of people from an assortment of backgrounds. They have used this method to discover not only what Whites did but what they thought they were doing. The people that emerge from these pages, although frequently absurd as most people are, are altogether more complex and varied than the Rhodesians in so many books and articles. Godwin and Hancock invoke the stereotypes this book is trying to abolish. On the one side there

are the Rhodesians who left and meet 'to remember the hurt of losing a country or to relive past glories' (p. 10). On the other side there are the Rhodesians constructed by a particular sort of scholarship. This is concerned 'to formulate the theory which correctly locates race and settler capitalism within the framework of class analysis' (p. 10). Godwin and Hancock briefly ponder whether the nostalgia of exile or a preoccupation with class produces the greater caricature of the varied reality of Rhodesians.

Perhaps the strongest impression of those last ten years of Rhodesia is how few Whites there were who knew what was going to happen. It was not that Rhodesians did not know what was happening in the war. Ignorance operated at a deeper level than day-to-day events. Censorship prevented any intelligent public discussion; but even without censorship Whites wanted to be fooled. It is worth recalling the more important of those various moments of self-deception. They believed that the majority of Blacks supported the 1971 Anglo-Rhodesian agreement; they believed that South Africa would always come to their rescue; they believed that Blacks liked being put into protected villages and that the guerrillas had no popular base; finally they believed that Muzorewa would win the 1980 elections. It was not simply ill-educated men and women who held to these extraordinary notions about the world they were supposed to control. Senior officers and civil servants believed them. Only the business world retained its sanity if sanity means having some sense of how other people think.

What this book shows however, is that no particular section of White society was more ignorant than any other. Until I read this book I have always been inclined to think that Internal Affairs was largely responsible for misleading the regime. Hostes Nicolle, the Secretary for Internal Affairs, was both enormously influential with the Cabinet and monumentally ignorant about what Blacks wanted. There is evidence, however, that people working for Internal Affairs in the north-east knew that there was unrest before the 1972 attack on Altena farm but their reports were ignored by higher officials in Salisbury who wanted only to hear of contented Blacks. Somewhere in the senior ranks of the army were men who knew that victory in a guerrilla war involved winning the confidence of the people. But there was so much rivalry between Hickman, Reid-Daly, MacIntyre and Walls that they had little energy left to win anyone's hearts and minds.

If I had to single out the principal strength of this superb book it would be the boldness with which its narrative mimics White Rhodesia's ignorance of the context in which it was living its life. The guerrillas and the nationalist leaders are largely absent in the book. They are present only when they attack White farms or when White politicians have to negotiate with them.

This allows Godwin and Hancock to convey the sense of what it was like for Whites living through those ten years. The cruelty and villainy and bumptious confidence are there of course. Also there are the surprisingly numerous people who hated what the Rhodesia Front was doing in their name. Some bitterly regretted the lives which were being sacrificed to hold off the inevitable. Others loved the country and wanted everyone to be able to enjoy its benefits. And others knew that Blacks were being denied their humanity and this was wrong. These are not the motives of heroic resistance. They do, however, counter the normal image of White Rhodesia with alternative and perhaps saving moments of ordinary decency.

*University of Zimbabwe*

ANTHONY CHENNELLS

**Society in Zimbabwe's Liberation War, Vol. Two** Edited by N. Bhebe and T. Ranger. Harare, University of Zimbabwe Publications, 1995, xii, 250 pp., ISBN 0-908307-37-3, Z\$60.

This book is an important and timely contribution to scholarship on Zimbabwe's experience during the liberation war. It is the outcome of the international conference on the Zimbabwean liberation war held in Harare in July 1991, which brought together academics and participants in the war to analyse the significance of the conflict to the Zimbabwean socio-economic and political reality. Unlike the earlier volume, also edited by N. Bhebe and T. Ranger and which focussed on the experiences of the soldiers, the current volume concentrates on the role of religion, education and ideology in the war, as well as the impact of the war on society at large, both during and after the conflict. It is an impressive effort by participants and leading academics who are concerned more with analysing the factors that shaped the Zimbabwean experience during the years of the conflict than with upholding the 'comfortable myths of the war'.

*Society in Zimbabwe's Liberation War* comprises nine chapters grouped into three sections, each focussing on a select theme. Section One, entitled 'Religion and the war', analyses three case studies of interaction between religion and the guerrillas. The first paper by T. Ranger and M. Ncube examines the role of both traditional religion and Christian missions in the liberation struggle in southern Matabeleland, while, the second and third contributions by D. Maxwell and J. McLaughlin respectively, provide interesting case studies of the war experiences of Christian missions in eastern Zimbabwe, one Catholic and the other protestant. All papers in this section demonstrate clearly that the relationship between religion and religious organisations and the guerrillas was a complex, dynamic and fluid one.

The role of ideology and education in the war is discussed in Section Two, where A. Chennells provides a fascinating analysis of settler ideology whilst P. M. Nare and F. Chung document ZAPU and ZANU's efforts to develop and maintain viable educational systems in the refugee camps of Zambia and Mozambique, respectively. Through an examination of several late-colonial novels published in Rhodesia, Chennells provides an insightful and interesting analysis of settler ideology in the closing years of colonial rule and demonstrates that, with a few exceptions, settlers completely failed to understand both the dynamics of African nationalism and African motivation and objectives in taking up arms against White rule. Remaining mired in a static view of the African as a child-like savage, incapable of analysis and independent action unless put up to it by some outside invisible hand, settlers completely failed to appreciate the nature of the force they were up against until the 1980 ZANU victory swept away both the settler colonial regime and its underpinning ideology.

Both Nare and Chung recount efforts by their respective parties to develop and sustain educational systems for the thousands of Zimbabweans in exile in Zambia and Mozambique. Their accounts reveal not only the complexity of the problems which confronted the two parties in their endeavours, but also the ingenuity, creativity and tenacity of those assigned the task of establishing and developing the programmes. Despite logistical and security problems, they succeeded in mounting viable and relevant educational programmes which eventually helped shape the country's post-war educational system.

In Section Three, N. Bhebe, J. Alexander and R. Werbner attempt to answer the question: What happened after the war? Entitled 'Legacies of the war', this section examines the problems facing the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Zimbabwe, the processes of post-war political change in Zimbabwe's rural areas and the heritage of war in southeastern Zimbabwe, respectively. N. Bhebe's knowledgeable treatment of the divisions and conflicts within the Evangelical Lutheran Church in southern Zimbabwe, born during the war but deepened and complicated by the post-independence conflict in Matabeleland, makes fascinating reading.

Equally interesting and thought-provoking is Werbner's analysis of the impact of the post-independence conflict in Matabeleland which traumatised the local communities. The local communities were not only denied a chance to recover from the brutalities of the liberation war in which they were victimised by both the Rhodesian Security Forces and the guerrillas, but were immediately plunged into another brutal conflict in which they were, once again, victimised by the Fifth Brigade which conducted itself like an army of occupation. According to Werbner, the subsequent 'remarkable increase in the number of mediums known as *sangoma*' (p. 200) in Matabeleland is an indication of how the local people

sought to come to terms with their catastrophic experiences and to begin the necessary post-conflict process of healing.

*Society in Zimbabwe's Liberation War* is a significant book because it tells the story of what occurred in those nightmarish years of the war and the post-war Matabeleland conflict and thus makes public what has hitherto remained closed to Zimbabwean society as a whole. By addressing these sensitive but important issues and attempting to understand the forces that helped shape Zimbabwe's current social and political reality, it provides the necessary foundation for that national healing process which cannot begin unless Zimbabwean society as a whole confronts the past, the 'heroic' and the 'terrible things', squarely in the face. The book will be useful to both professional researchers and academics because it points to new directions for academic enquiry. It will also be useful to the general public, who need to know what happened then in order to come to terms with the present reality as well as to contribute towards the construction of a Zimbabwean society in which such traumatic experiences are never repeated.

University of Zimbabwe

A. S. MLAMBO

**Are We Not Also Men? The Samkange Family and African Politics in Zimbabwe 1920 to 1964** By Terence Ranger. London, James Currey Ltd.; Cape Town, David Phillip (Pty) Ltd.; Portsmouth, Heinemann, 1995, iv, 211 pp., ISBN 0-435-03977-3, Z\$135.

Professor Terence Ranger, whose earlier works, especially *Revolt in Southern Rhodesia* and its sequel, *The African Voice in Southern Rhodesia 1898-1930*, established him as a household name among Zimbabwean historians and freedom fighters, has once again produced in *Are We Not Also Men?* an outstanding study of the rise of the African élite and mass African politics in Zimbabwe. Before reading his latest book, it might have been difficult to imagine that Ranger had anything new to tell us on these topics. Admittedly readers will tread on familiar ground in this book, but they will also find familiar things presented in a different and refreshingly new light together with some new discoveries, some of which substantially revise our current views of certain important events and social developments. In particular, Ranger throws new light on gender relations among the emergent African élite, argues for a very radical and relevant African National Congress in the mid and late 1940s, and disputes Edison Zvobgo's assertion that the National Democratic Party leadership planned and orchestrated the violent demonstrations and riots in Bulawayo in 1960.

Such new insights resulted from a wide range of sources, some of which have not been tapped before. In the National Archives, Ranger consulted Methodist records especially the papers of Herbert Carter, who was close to Thompson Samkange and Chairman of the Rhodesian Methodist District for many years, and the Rhodesian press devoted to African affairs. Ranger was the first to consult the Samkange family archive, containing rich deposits of Thompson's and his son Stanlake's papers, and he complemented all this with oral interviews as well as his own personal recollections and those of his wife Shelagh, both of whom actively participated in the transition of African politics from élitist protests to mass nationalism in the late 1950s and early 1960s.

The book is primarily a biography of Thompson Samkange, one of the early African Methodist pastors in this country, and his two sons, Stanlake and Sketchley. All the three were deeply involved in the politics of this country. Ranger's study of them offers a unique opportunity to look at colonialism, and African opposition to it, through the experience and motivation of an African family. Ranger covers other important sub-themes, including the emergence of an African middle class, 'the rise — and also the fall — of the ideal of Christian civilization' and 'the role of women in the making of the Zimbabwean middle class and some of the costs of their involvement'.

Ranger draws our attention to three features of Thompson's christianity which deeply influenced his ecclesiastical and political careers, namely the political implications he drew from the concept of 'Christian Civilization', his attachment to ecumenism and his fervent Wesleyan Methodist evangelism. On ecumenism, the book pays little attention to other churches in the movement and so misses something of his contribution to Christianity in this country.

Ranger exposes the rise of the Samkanges as a middle class family. Thompson was a 'progressive' Christian leader, who set out consciously to build a middle class family. In this he was assisted by his wife Grace, also an early convert to Methodism. Their task involved transforming gender relations between themselves and among their children; investing heavily in family education; and providing a secure base for the family.

Both Grace and Thompson insisted on the equal education of both male and female children and training all the children without gender distinction in domestic and other activities of the family. Contrary to the recent assertions<sup>1</sup> that wives of emergent African élites in the colonial period had their importance diminished, Ranger shows that Grace became 'famous and honoured' through her leadership roles in the large Samkange

---

<sup>1</sup>See for example Elizabeth Schmidt, *Peasants, Traders and Wives* (London, James Currey; Portsmouth N. H., Heinemann, 1992).



'extended' family and in the Ruwadzano. This was possible in Thompson's environment that accepted the Christian ideal of equality between husband and wife in marriage and in which educated women were to be given free reign to exercise their skills and talents not only in the rural but also in the urban areas.

Together with the rest of the emergent African middle class, the Samkanges believed in providing their children with a sound education. They sent all their children through primary and teachers' training at Waddilove, and two received secondary schooling and university education in South Africa. All this entailed enormous investment in effort and money. Therefore Thompson and Grace established a secure home on a private property in the Msengezi African Purchase Area, which Grace managed while Thompson continued his educational and pastoral work. The two were also particular about their children's marriages, insisting on partners of equal educational status. Unfortunately children who for one reason or another did not perform or live up to expectations became what Ranger calls 'casualties of progress'.

Although Ranger stresses too much the peculiarity of this family, his rewarding use of a family archive and family biography has blazed a trail for all of us in our striving to understand the creation of the élite in this country.

A trip to India and Ceylon in 1938 brought Thompson into contact with famous nationalists of the third world, and with the indigenous Methodist church of Ceylon. On being appointed on his return superintendent of Pakame circuit, Thompson tried to implement his Tambaram vision of the church. Although he was successful in laying a foundation for a future indigenous Methodist church in Zimbabwe by producing many African ministers, his full vision remained a mere mirage. Neither African Methodists, who had apparently put off the prospects of an indigenous church by the financial implications of self-reliance, nor the young White missionaries, who felt their dominance threatened, supported him. His superintendency of Pakame, which he had so much wanted as part of the advancement of Africans in church leadership, in fact proved to be his undoing. A poor bookkeeper and record keeper, he found himself exposed to severe criticisms by White education officers and young missionaries. Finally, he clashed with young African progressives who wanted to improve their schools but found his ecclesiastical controls on education stifling.

Such opposition to progressive church leaders from local communities and White missionaries is not peculiar to Thompson and the Methodist church. This opposition stands out more clearly in the biographical approach of this book than in general studies of missionaries and churches.

In the political arena Ranger sheds new light on Samkange and his leadership of Congress. The current picture is that of a weak Congress in the mid-1940s and of an ineffectual leader. Ranger shows that Samkange was elected to the leadership of Congress in July 1943 specifically to rejuvenate and radicalise the organisation. Samkange focused attention on two key political issues of the time — opposition to the proposed amalgamation of Southern Rhodesia with Northern Rhodesia and Nyasaland and to the threatened limitations of the already limited African franchise. His growing disillusionment with the failed promises of Christian civilisation in the church and with the emptiness of British justice and freedom, served to radicalise Thompson's leadership. He urged the building of a mass organisation through the mobilisation of the rural people so that the colonial government could not dismiss Congress as a mere clique of malcontents. While Ranger brings out the expressed radicalism of Thompson, there is little evidence of translation into concrete action on the ground. Moreover the key issues which he concentrated on were more the concern of the élite than of the masses. Ranger is aware of this criticism: 'It was not in Thompson to place himself unequivocally at the head of rural or urban protest' (p. 121). Yet the urban and rural protests offered the surest road to successful and popular leadership and a way out of being a mere élitist leader.

The use of the Samkange family archive has also enabled Ranger to correct substantially our views of the role of Congress and Samkange in the 1948 strike. Where previously some of us saw no role for Samkange and Congress in this strike, Ranger demonstrates that they were very much involved.

Thompson's last years were years of disillusionment, disappointment and bitterness. His clashes with Native Education Department officials at Pakame got worse and his superintendency and ecclesiastical authority came under heavy criticism in some of his village schools. There were slanders concerning church money and examinations. All this seemed to be directed by White missionaries and education officers towards undermining his leadership and role in education and the church and therefore towards discrediting African leadership in general.

Further disappointment came with the dismal failure of the young educated generation to provide selfless leadership and service to their people. Thompson and other older leaders had been delighted when Stanlake, Tennyson Hlabangana and Enoch Dumbutshena came back armed with university degrees and took over the leadership of Congress. But by 1953 these had led Congress into oblivion. The educated youth quarrelled among themselves. Attracted by a promise of partnership, Stanlake got sucked into the politics of multi-racialism, which already had become irrelevant for the people. The disillusioned Thompson saw all these

flirtations with White politics by the educated as mere self-seeking and roundly declared, 'the so-called educated African . . . (is) a danger to the community and to himself'.

To understand the careers of Stanlake and Sketchley, Ranger tells us we need to know the ideas held by their father Thompson, which after his death became increasingly incompatible and could not be successfully espoused by one person. Thompson advocated a national political movement which concentrated on common interests and left intact autonomous institutions, organisations and practices of civil society. He could not have tolerated the totalitarian behaviour of mass nationalism at its height, when for instance people were directed not to attend Sunday services in order to be at political rallies. He held education to be compatible with service and not merely a stepping stone to higher and more lucrative professional and other economic rewards as became later common practice. He was opposed to the secularisation of the school system. He would have applauded any African initiatives directed towards self-reliance; this would have been in line with his call for indigenisation in the church. He condemned White racism as much as he abhorred 'Black racist repudiation of Whites'.

After Thompson's death the growing divergence of his ideas seemed to be epitomised by the divergent careers of Stanlake and Sketchley. Stanlake became an ally of Garfield Todd and a champion of multi-racialism, while Sketchley became intimately associated with, and involved in, mass nationalism. But both of them had the streak of their father's idealism and shunning of authoritarian violence. Thus Stanlake successfully pursued the Nyatsime project, promoting self-help in education. Even when he broke up with Todd in 1961 and was attracted to mass nationalism, Stanlake hesitated from joining either NDP or ZAPU, being put off by their apparent intolerance of dissent and of the autonomy of civil society institutions.

In the meantime, Sketchley combined his father's nationalism and conviction in non-violence. When Congress was banned in 1959, many leaders were involved in the politics of Federation and were reluctant to take on leadership of a new organisation. Sketchley was able to fill this vacuum. Brought up on his father's stories and admiration of Gandhi's philosophy of non-violence, Sketchley urged NDP to use non-violence as a weapon against the colonial system and authorities. On this Ranger differs from Edison Zvobgo. In 1983, Zvobgo claimed that Sketchley's public statements of non-violence camouflaged his preparations with Michael Mawema for the violence which later erupted in the Bulawayo riots and demonstrations in 1960. Ranger writes:

In my view Zvobgo's account is influenced partly by a desire to praise Mawema's leadership at the expense of Joshua Nkomo and Ndabaningi Sithole, and partly by a desire to establish as early a date as possible for the origins of the liberation war (p. 181).

One of the outcomes of the violent disturbances was the decision of the two brothers — Stanlake and Sketchley — to pull out of political leadership.

One thing that students and other researchers will find irritating about the book is its omission of a section on sources and bibliography. Frankly the otherwise excellent discussion in the introduction of the main archives used is not a substitute for the traditional bibliography.

The omission, however, is minor compared to the importance of the book. Written by one of the few accomplished and devoted scholars of modern Zimbabwean history, who has the further advantage of having been an active participant in some of the events that are dealt with in *Are We Not Also Men?*, this book will for a long time remain important reading for both the general reader and history students in the study of the rise of the African middle class and of mass nationalism in Zimbabwe.

*University of Zimbabwe*

PROFESSOR NGWABI BHEBE

**Labour Export Policy in the Development of Southern Africa** By Bill Paton. Harare, University of Zimbabwe Publications; London, Macmillan Press Ltd., 1995, xii, 397 pp., ISBN 0-908-307-41-1, Z\$100.

In this book, Paton seeks to contribute to an understanding of the origins and functions of cross-border migration, and of states in the labour exporting countries of Southern Africa. The study is motivated by the need to explicate two major propositions. The first one is that 'the evolution of the power to control labour flows among the jurisdictions of different territorial administrations in Southern Africa was of major importance in the formation of a regional system of states' (p. 3). The second one is that 'the overall importance of the policies of labour-exporting administrations has been seriously downplayed' (p. 15) in past studies of the phenomenon of labour migration in Southern Africa, hence the need for an elaboration of the various policies undertaken by the different states in managing and controlling labour flows in the sub-region.

That the countries of Southern Africa have historically been intertwined in a web of cheap labour circulation centred around the sub-centre of the South African economy (which itself is a periphery in the global economy) is a well-known fact to lay-persons and academics alike. On the political plane the emergence of groups such as the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), the Frontline States, and the Southern Africa Labour Commission (SALC) is either directly or indirectly motivated by the need to reduce the dependency of labour exporting countries on South Africa.

The belief that Southern Africa represents a unique configuration of states is one of the reasons there is the current paralysis in the attempt to

harmonise the two regional organisations of SADC (the former SADCC — Southern African Development Coordinating Conference), and COMESA (the former Preferential Trade Area — encompassing countries in Southern, Central and Eastern Africa).

Paton is well aware of the obviousness of the issue he has decided to tackle, but insists that he has something new and unique to say by way of a contribution to an understanding of the political economy of Southern Africa. Paton's point of departure is the bold assertion that the major factor in the formation and evolution of the concept of the state among the labour exporting countries of Southern Africa, and of the notion that these states together comprise a unique constellation, was the preoccupation with controlling and managing labour flows between their countries and South Africa. In this regard, he criticises approaches of neo-classical economics to labour migration for over-emphasising individualistic welfare maximisation theories that more-or-less take the migrant as a free individual; and anthropological approaches that emphasise 'push' and 'pull' factors in microscopic detail while losing sight of the larger structural environment that conditions the whole migratory process.

Paton locates himself within what he refers to as the historical/structural school which relates migration theory to historical explications of unequal development, dependency, centre-periphery relations and world systems approaches. Paton, however, contends that this school has also failed to account adequately for the manner in which the labour-exporting states have evolved as a consequence of the migrant labour phenomenon, even if the interaction between capital and the state has been thoroughly discussed by this school. Paton's main reservation with regard to the historical/structural school, especially as reflected in the writings of analysts on Southern Africa, is that they have tended to see the state as an instrument of, or as the referee between, dominant factions of capital, thereby failing to appreciate that the state may actually develop a relative degree of autonomy in economic and labour policies quite independent of the needs of individual capitals *per se*.

In reviewing the role and functions of the labour-exporting states in Southern Africa, Paton identifies as the most interesting aspect, 'the radical gain in state autonomy with regard to labour export, over time' (p. 19), and it is the explication of this phenomenon that preoccupies him throughout the book, covering a century or so of the history of eight labour-exporting countries in Southern Africa. Paton notes that while the eight countries are different, 'they are complementary, for all are part of a single regional economy and state system'. He proceeds to observe that the evolution of these states is paralleled by an apparently linear progression in labour export policy from that preoccupied by the need to

satisfy the interests of metropolitan capital, to that of meeting the needs of internal capital, and eventually, to that of addressing the particular needs of the states themselves. The bulk of the book consists of an account of the see-saw type oscillations in the labour export policies of the individual eight countries of Southern Africa covered, namely, Malawi, Zambia, Zimbabwe, Mozambique, Tanzania, Lesotho, Swaziland, and Botswana, in that order.

Paton argues that the major consideration in the management of labour flows by each of the states was the need to maximise the economic returns accruing to the state in the context of the cyclical oscillations of internal labour supplies induced by labour surpluses and shortages. In this respect, he notes that the individual labour exporting countries were not altogether powerless with respect to influencing the nature of the resulting labour flows, but increasingly became autonomous in asserting their independent interests as well. Accordingly, the rest of the book reviews the labour management policies of the individual eight countries over a century or so of their colonial and post-colonial experiences.

Paton's book is welcome and valuable for at least three reasons. First, it has brought together in one place the various historical experiences of the Southern African labour exporting countries for easy reference and comparison. Second, the book has been bold enough to make explicit a very fundamental aspect of the economic intertwinement of the countries of the sub-region as rooted in labour flows which, to a large degree, are seen to be at the heart of the unequal development among the different countries in the sub-region. It may be noted here that there is a tendency by governments officially and publicly to underplay the importance of illegal and legal labour migration as the *de facto* all-preponderant and pervasive mode of economic interaction among the countries of the sub-region in preference to emphasising cross-border trade and investment as the more economically and politically correct concerns, even if this labour migration is not only increasing but also becoming increasingly differentiated as well to include the intelligentsia of some countries. An interesting aspect of this bold assertion of the importance of labour migration in the political economy of the countries of Southern Africa is the demonstration of the manner in which it has been linked to unequal development among the different countries, an aspect that should be food for thought for those attempting to promote regional economic cooperation rather uncritically.

The third contribution the book makes is that it provides a good background to the re-emergence of the labour issue in Southern Africa following the advent of majority rule in South Africa. The issue has now become more complex in that it relates to cross-border flows of both low-skilled and high-skilled or educated labour. For the former type of labour

flows, the deduction from the book's analysis is that there might be a need for states to counter-balance the maximisation of revenue from such labour exports with measures to ameliorate the negative repercussions resulting from such exports as reflected in the inadvertent rural under-development that has accompanied such labour out-flows within labour exporting countries, quite apart from attempting to ensure ample supplies of cheap labour for domestic entrepreneurs. For the latter type of labour flows which have not been addressed in the book, the emerging issue concerns the need to recoup foregone human resource investments represented by the brain drain afflicting many of the countries. Thus the book is quite timely in that it usefully informs on the manner in which the harmonisation of labour flows might be approached and pursued in Southern Africa as part of the quest for mutually beneficial regional economic cooperation in both the short and long runs.

The book, however, has some major shortcomings. The first one relates to the attempt to validate his first thesis, namely, the assertion that the development of the countries as states and as a constellation of states is primarily related to their preoccupation with the management of labour flows within and between countries of the sub-region. In attempting to demonstrate this thesis, Paton has seized on a very simplistic and functional definition of the state and its role, quite irrespective of the substantial literature pertaining to this debate both in its generality and as related to the African context and in its specificity with respect to particular countries in Southern Africa.

In over-emphasising the importance of labour migration in the emergence of the countries of the sub-region from colonies to states, and from states to nations, he has of necessity ignored the complex internal and external factors, and their dynamics, that have been at the heart of this evolution. More importantly, in this respect, is the fact that Paton has completely neglected to discuss the reactions of the Africans themselves to the emerging domestic and sub-regional economic developments for which labour migration was a key facilitating factor.

The evolution from colonial status to state-hood, and on to nation-hood, was characterised by the complex interplay of struggles and adaptations by the African masses, with associated reactions by the respective representatives of the state which continuously redefined both state-hood and nation-hood quite irrespective of the phenomenon of labour migration, even if this may have acted as one of the major backdrops. This complex interplay of factors and forces at the social, political and economic levels is completely ignored by the book, such that Africans are seen to be mere passive objects of the manipulations of capital and the various states, both colonial and post-colonial. In this respect, the book does little justice to the nature and content of the emergence of African nationalism

and its consequent contradictions related to the unending, and seemingly unachievable, quest for the consolidation of both state-hood and nation-hood.

A second shortcoming relates to the fact that the book neglects to give the background to the issue being discussed particularly in form of the structure of the economies both within the context of the sub-regional and the international division of labour. This background is taken for granted, even if it is constantly referred to as the backdrop to the labour flows. An exposition of the economic background to the individual countries and how they fitted into the sub-regional and international division of labour or pattern of specialisation would have helped the reader to assess the relative importance of the labour issue in the development of the state in each of the individual countries. This would have been important since in some of the countries such as Zimbabwe, internal economic developments were significant enough to redefine the role of the state somewhat independently of a preoccupation with the management of labour exports and imports *per se*, even if the management of internal labour supplies was nonetheless always a crucial consideration in the apartheid-type economies of Zimbabwe and South Africa and their immediate peripheries. In this respect also, it might be pointed out that labour flows were only one aspect of an emerging sub-regional economic system dominated by South Africa that increasingly included regional flows of goods and services and investments primarily from the latter country to the other countries.

In conclusion, this book is highly recommended for those wishing to have a clearer picture of the intertwinement of the labour needs of the various countries of the sub-region and of their possible implications for regional cooperation and the formulation of equitable development strategies within and between countries, even if the major thesis of the book is inadequately validated and appears rather unconvincing.

UNDP/ILO Lesotho

GUY C. Z. MHONE